

In the previous example I showed:

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge \neg Q)$$

Now I want to find out whether

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

I write down the truth table as usual. The first steps are as in the previous example. Only the second line differs from the previous example.

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

I assume that the premiss is true and  
that the conclusion is false

$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
		T	F

If a disjunction  $\phi \vee \psi$  is false then  $\phi$  and  $\psi$  must be false.

Now there is no unique way to continue. So I distinguish two cases:

$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge \neg Q)$
		T	F <sub>1</sub> F F <sub>1</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge \neg Q)$$

$P \leftrightarrow Q$  can be true because  $P$  and  $Q$  are both true or because they are both false.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge \neg Q)$		
1			$T_2 \ T \ T_2$	$F_1$	$F$	$F_1$
2			$F_2 \ T \ F_2$	$F_1$	$F$	$F_1$

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

So  $P$  is true in the first line.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$		
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub>	F	F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	F	F <sub>1</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

Since  $P \wedge Q$  is false,  $Q$  must be false; but that contradicts my assumption that  $Q$  is true. So I put a question mark here: the line cannot be completed.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>1</sub> F F <sub>1</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

I turn to the second case:  $P$  and  $Q$   
are both false...

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$			
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	? F	F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	F	F <sub>3</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

and so  $\neg P$  must be true.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$				
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	?	F	F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	F	T <sub>4</sub>	F <sub>3</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>



$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

As  $\neg P \wedge Q$  is false and  $\neg P$  is true,  $Q$  must be false, which is exactly what I have assumed.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$				
1			$T_2 \ T \ T_2$	$T_3$	$F_1$	$?$	$F$	$F_1$
2			$F_2 \ T \ F_2$	$F_1$	$F$	$T_4$	$F_3$	$F_1 \ F_5$

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

I add the truth values for  $P$  and  $Q$   
in  $P \wedge Q$

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2			F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

So  $P$  and  $Q$  must be false.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>

I didn't find any problems with this line. To make sure that I haven't missed a clash of truth values, I recalculate this line to make sure that the premiss is true and the conclusion is false if  $P$  and  $Q$  are both false.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

Going through the line once more is important as otherwise you can't be sure you haven't overlooked a problem.

So I start from the truth value F for P and Q.

	P	Q	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>
	F	F		

I copy the truth value F under every occurrence of  $P$  and  $Q$ .

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>
	F	F	F F	F F F F

Then I complete the line in the usual way.

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			$T_2 \ T \ T_2$	$T_3 \ F_1 \ ? \ F \quad F_1$
2	$F$	$F$	$F_2 \ T \ F_2$	$F_6 \ F_1 \ F_7 \ F \quad T_4 \ F_3 \ F_1 \ F_5$
	$F$	$F$	$F \ T \ F$	$F \quad F \quad F \quad F$



$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>
	F	F	F T F	F F F F F

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>
	F	F	F T F	F F F T F F

$$P \leftrightarrow Q \equiv (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$$

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F T <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub>
	F	F	F T F	F F F T F F F

Yes, I have found a line in which the premiss is true and the conclusion is false. So I have proved that  $P \leftrightarrow Q \neq (P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$ .

	$P$	$Q$	$P \leftrightarrow Q$	$(P \wedge Q) \vee (\neg P \wedge Q)$								
1			T <sub>2</sub> T T <sub>2</sub>	T <sub>3</sub> F <sub>1</sub> ? F								F <sub>1</sub>
2	F	F	F <sub>2</sub> T F <sub>2</sub>	F <sub>6</sub> F <sub>1</sub> F <sub>7</sub> F	T <sub>4</sub>	F <sub>3</sub>	F <sub>1</sub>	F <sub>5</sub>				
	F	F	F T F	F F F F	T	F	F	F				