

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

I'll prove the following claim:

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

This is an unpleasant proof.

I will prove the conclusion by assuming its negation
 $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$ and proving a contradiction. \neg -Elim will then allow me to obtain $\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$.

From $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$, which is logically equivalent to $\forall y \neg(P \rightarrow Ry)$, one can derive P . Combining this with the premiss gives $\exists y Ry$. If now Rb is assumed this can be shown to contradict $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$.

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

First I'll derive P from $\neg\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$.
I assume P and $\neg P$. I'll try to get a
contradiction to conclude P by \neg -Elim.

$$P$$

$$\neg P$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Applying \neg -Elim to $\neg Ra$ gives Ra . This is ok even though $\neg Ra$ has never been assumed.

$$\frac{P \qquad \neg P}{Ra}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Now I apply \rightarrow -Intro.

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} [P] & \neg P \\ \hline Ra \end{array}}{P \rightarrow Ra}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

This is an application of \exists Intro.

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} [P] & \neg P \\ \hline Ra \\ \hline \frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)} \end{array}}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Following my plan, I assume
 $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$ to get a contradiction.

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} [P] & \neg P \\ \hline Ra \\ \hline \frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)} & \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \end{array}}{\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Applying \neg -Elim yields P .

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} [P] \qquad [\neg P] \\ \hline Ra \\ \hline \frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)} \\ \hline P \end{array}}{P}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Now I assume the premiss...

$$\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{\frac{Ra}{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{P}}}}{P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

to get $\exists y Ry$ by \rightarrow -Elim.

$$\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Ra} \quad \frac{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}{P \quad P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}}{\exists y Ry}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

To use $\exists y Ry$, I assume Rb , which will be discharged by \exists Elim.

$$\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{\frac{Ra}{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\frac{P \quad P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}{\exists y Ry}}}}}{Rb}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

The conclusion is easily derived from this by \rightarrow Intro and \exists Intro.

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} [P] \quad [\neg P] \\ \hline Ra \\ \hline \frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)} \end{array}}{\frac{P \quad \frac{P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}{\exists yRy}}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}} \quad \frac{Rb}{\frac{P \rightarrow Rb}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

Now I apply \exists Elim.

$$\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{\frac{Ra}{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\frac{P \quad P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}{\frac{\exists y Ry}{\frac{[Rb]}{\frac{P \rightarrow Rb}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Rb)}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}}}}}}}}}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

I have derived the conclusion. The only missing bit is that $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$ is still not discharged. So I assume $\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$ once more.

$$\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{\frac{Ra}{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad \neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\frac{P \quad P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}{\frac{\exists y Ry}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}}}}} \quad \frac{[Rb]}{\frac{P \rightarrow Rb}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\neg \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}}}$$

$$P \rightarrow \exists y Ry \vdash \exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$$

¬Elim allows me to discharge both assumptions of $\neg\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)$.

$$\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{\frac{Ra}{\frac{P \rightarrow Ra}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry) \quad [\neg\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)]}{\frac{P \quad P \rightarrow \exists y Ry}{\frac{\exists y Ry}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\frac{[Rb]}{\frac{P \rightarrow Rb}{\frac{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}{\frac{[\neg\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)]}{\exists y(P \rightarrow Ry)}}}}}}}}}}$$