

We want to show that  $\neg\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \vdash \forall x (Px \rightarrow Qx)$ .

We want to show that  $\neg\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \vdash \forall x (Px \rightarrow Qx)$ .

I will prove the conclusion by proving  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  and applying  $\forall$ Intro.

We want to show that  $\neg\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \vdash \forall x (Px \rightarrow Qx)$ .

I will prove the conclusion by proving  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  and applying  $\forall$ Intro.

To prove  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  I assume its negation  $\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$  and prove from this  $Pa \wedge \neg Qa$ . Applying  $\exists$ Intro will give me  $\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)$ , which contradicts the premiss and I can conclude  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  by applying  $\neg$ Elim.

I write down the negation of  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  and try to obtain  $Pa$ .  
To this end I assume  $Pa$  and  $\neg Pa$ .

$\neg Pa$        $Pa$

$\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$

Using  $\neg$ -Elim I conclude  $Qa$ .

$$\frac{\neg Pa \quad Pa}{Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$$

Now I apply  $\rightarrow$ Intro to discharge  $Pa$ .

$$\frac{\frac{\neg Pa \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$$

This yields a contradiction,  
which allows me to apply  
 $\neg$ -Elim and  $\neg Pa$  is discharged  
as well.

$$\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa}$$

$$\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa}$$

Following my plan, I try to prove  $\neg Qa$  from the assumption  $\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$ . I try to do this by assuming  $Qa$  hoping that I can apply  $\neg$ -Intro.

$$Qa \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$$



But that's easy because I can  
derive  $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  by  $\rightarrow$ Intro...

$$\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa}$$

$$\frac{Qa}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$$

and applying then  $\neg$ -Intro.

$$\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa}$$

$$\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{\neg Qa}$$

The plan is to prove

$Pa \wedge \neg Qa \dots$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa} \quad \frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{\neg Qa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa}$$

... and to apply  $\exists$ Intro,

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa} \quad \frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{\neg Qa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa}}{\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)}$$

which contradicts the premiss.

$$\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{Pa} \quad \frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad \neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)}{\neg Qa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa} \\ \frac{\quad}{\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)} \quad \neg \exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)$$

So using  $\neg$ -Elim I infer  
 $Pa \rightarrow Qa$  and discharge  
 $\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)$ .

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{Pa}}{\frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{\neg Qa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa}}{\frac{\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \quad \neg \exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)}{Pa \rightarrow Qa}}$$

Finally there is no  
undischarged assumption left  
that contains the constant  $a$ .  
Thus, I can apply  $\forall$ Intro.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{Pa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa} \quad \frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{\neg Qa}}{\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \quad \neg\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)} \\ \frac{Pa \rightarrow Qa}{\forall x (Px \rightarrow Qx)}$$

Apart from the premiss there is no undischarged assumption left. So the proof is complete.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[\neg Pa] \quad [Pa]}{Qa}}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{Pa}}{\frac{\frac{[Qa]}{Pa \rightarrow Qa} \quad [\neg(Pa \rightarrow Qa)]}{\neg Qa}}{Pa \wedge \neg Qa}}{\frac{\exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx) \quad \neg \exists x (Px \wedge \neg Qx)}{Pa \rightarrow Qa}}{\forall x (Px \rightarrow Qx)}}$$