

I want to show that $\neg(P \rightarrow Q) \vdash P \wedge \neg Q$.

At first I explain how to find the proof.

The conclusion is a conjunction. I try to get it by \wedge Intro. So the end of the proof looks like this:

$$\frac{\frac{P}{\quad} \quad \frac{\quad}{\neg Q}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

First I turn to the left branch ending with P . I assume $\neg P$. From this and the premise $\neg(P \rightarrow Q)$ I try to get a contradiction, so \neg -Elim can be applied to get P .

$$\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{\neg P}{\neg Q}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

I try to obtain $P \rightarrow Q$ from the assumption P by \rightarrow Intro. This would contradict $\neg(P \rightarrow Q)$. So I assume $\neg P$.

$$\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{P \rightarrow Q}{\neg P}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

P and $\neg P$ yield already Q by \neg -Elim (although $\neg Q$ has never been assumed). The assumption P is discharged according to \rightarrow -Intro. The assumption $\neg P$ is discharged according to \neg -Elim.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\quad}}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{\neg Q}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

To obtain $\neg Q$ I assume Q in order to apply \neg -Intro. I have discharged Q here already according to \neg -Intro.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\quad}}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{\quad}}{\quad} \quad \frac{[Q]}{\neg Q}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

I have the premise $\neg(P \rightarrow Q)$ that I can use to produce a contradiction.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\quad}}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{P \wedge \neg Q} \quad \frac{[Q] \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\neg Q}}$$

Applying \rightarrow Intro to Q gives $P \rightarrow Q$
though P hasn't been assumed.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P}}{\quad} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{\quad} \quad \frac{\frac{[Q]}{P \rightarrow Q} \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\neg Q}}{\quad}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

Now I go through the proof once more, but this time in the correct order and noting the rules used.

assumptions

P $\neg P$

\neg -Elim applied to the assumption $\neg Q$. This is again a case where I apply \neg -Elim to an assumption that has never been made in the proof.

$$\frac{P \quad \neg P}{Q}$$

\rightarrow Intro; assumption P discharged

$$\frac{[P] \quad \neg P}{\frac{Q}{P \rightarrow Q}}$$

premiss

$$\neg(P \rightarrow Q) \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad \neg P}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}$$

\neg -Elim; assumption $\neg P$ discharged

$$\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q) \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{P}}$$

assumption

$$\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{Q}$$

\rightarrow Intro

$$\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}$$

premiss

$$\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)} \quad \frac{Q}{P \rightarrow Q} \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)$$

\neg -Intro; assumption Q discharged

$$\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q} \quad P \rightarrow Q}{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)} \quad \frac{[Q] \quad P \rightarrow Q}{\neg Q} \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)$$

\wedge Intro

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\quad}}{P} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{\quad}}{\frac{\frac{\frac{[Q]}{P \rightarrow Q} \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\quad}}{\neg Q}}{\quad}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$

All assumptions are discharged; only the premiss $\neg(P \rightarrow Q)$ remains undischarged. Thus the proof is complete.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{P}}{\quad} \quad \frac{\frac{[P] \quad [\neg P]}{Q}}{P \rightarrow Q}}{\quad}}{\quad} \quad \frac{\frac{[Q]}{P \rightarrow Q} \quad \neg(P \rightarrow Q)}{\neg Q}}{\quad}}{P \wedge \neg Q}$$